

Records of Meetings

Year: 2019

Signed Chairman Senator Kristina Moore	The following records of meetings have been approved by the Panel.
Chairman	Signed
	L'élia.

Record of Meeting

Date: 8th January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Item 8 only:
	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes
	Tom Queree, Legislation and Policy Manager, States Treasury and
	Exchequer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The records of the meetings held on 13th, 14th, 20th, 23rd and 27th November and 11th and 17th December 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Draft Damages Law	
It was agreed to request a briefing from the States Treasury and Exchequer Department on the States' insurance arrangements, including the impact of the recent large damages settlement.	SS
The Panel discussed the Scottish damages bill currently before the Scottish parliament and considered that this could form a good model for Jersey to follow.	
It was noted that draft heads of report would be circulated to the Panel after the meeting. It was further agreed to issue a press release outlining the Panel's work to date.	ss
3. Revenue Administration Law	
It was noted that the deadline for submissions to the Panel's review was 10th January and that a number of stakeholders had indicated they would be providing evidence to the Panel.	
4. Contingency allocations	
The Panel noted receipt of documentation in relation to the recent funding from contingency provided for the Jersey College for Girls International Pilot Programme. It was agreed to prepare an oral question on the matter to ask at the next States sitting.	ss
5. States Business	
The Panel reviewed recent Ministerial Decisions which fell within its remit. Noting various awards from Contingency Funding made in December 2018, it was agreed to	

request a meeting with the Chief of Staff and Chief Operating Officer to discuss contingency funding provided to their departments.	SS
6. Public Sector Pay	
Noting the forthcoming strike action to be taken by public sector staff, the Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to seek confirmation of his intentions regarding the leadership of the States Employment Board (S.E.B) and to request an urgent public hearing with the S.E.B within the next two weeks.	ss
7. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was on 22nd January 2019 at 9.30am in the Blampied room.	
8. Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister, Comptroller of Taxes and Legislation and Policy Manager for a public hearing on the Revenue Administration Law. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
1 TOSCIII	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (Chairman, Public Accounts Committee)
	Deputy Rowland Huelin (Public Accounts Committee member)
	Tim Rogers (Public Accounts Committee member)
	Adrian Lane (Public Accounts Committee member)
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Deputy Suzie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and
	Population Department
	Maria Washington, States Treasury and Exchequer
	Rob Kirby, Partner, KPMG
	Mark Ashburn, Associate Director, KPMG
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Finances Law	
The Panel met jointly with the Public Accounts Committee to receive a briefing on changes to the Public Finances Law (PFL). It was noted that the current draft of the new PFL had been circulated to both the Panel and the Public Accounts Committee prior to the briefing.	
The background to the review of the PFL was explained. This included concerns expressed about the prescriptive nature of the current law, that most jurisdictions review their public finances laws every 15 years and have a budgeting framework based on an annual budget supported by 2-5 years financial outlook.	
It was noted that the new PFL would take the form of enabling legislation, supported by a Public Finances Manual. The different parts of the draft law were outlined, including key changes from the current law.	
It was noted that it was anticipated that the draft law would be lodged in February 2019 and it was agreed to arrange a further briefing on the draft law prior to lodging.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 16th January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
In attendance	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Simon Hayward, Director of Treasury Operations and Investments
	Martin McCarthy, Senior Accountant – Insurance Management
	Sylvia Roberts, Law Officers Department
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel received a private briefing from the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources and officers on the States' insurance arrangements.	
The record of this part of the meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 33.	
After the witnesses had withdrawn, the Panel considered the evidence it had received during the review. The Panel recalled that it had written to the Chief Minister on 20th December asking whether consideration had been given to withdrawing the draft law in light of the evidence submitted to the Panel criticizing the draft law. It was noted that a reply from the Chief Minister had been received on 11th January informing the Panel that he would not be withdrawing the draft law.	
In light of the Chief Minister's refusal to withdraw the draft law, the Panel noted that the Chairman had scoped possible amendments to the draft law based on the evidence received by the Panel. A number of differing views were expressed by Panel members about the draft law and possible amendments. While some Panel members felt uncomfortable about the law proceeding in its current form, it was ultimately decided not to proceed with amendments.	
In answer to some of the concerns expressed in evidence to the Panel, it was agreed to recommend in the Panel's report that the Chief Minister should bring forward regulations as soon as possible in relation to the discount rate and Periodical Payment Orders.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 21st January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister and Chair of the States
	Employment Board
	Connétable Richard Buchanan, States Employment Board
	Connétable Deidre Mezbourian, States Employment Board
	Deputy Susie Pinel, States Employment Board
	Deputy Graham Truscott, States Employment Board
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Jacquie McGeachie, Director, People Services
	Chris Stephenson, Director, HR Employment Relations and Organisational
	Development
	Jonathan Donovan, Head of Pay and Reward and Employee Relations
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
Public Hearing with the States Employment Board	
The Panel received the Chief Minister, members of the States Employment Board and officers for a public hearing on public sector pay. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 22nd January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Item 8 only: Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Rachel Williams, Head of Governance, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Michala Bell, Human Resources Business Partner

Agenda matter	Action
Briefing on Target Operating Model for Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department	
The Panel received the Director General of the Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department and officers for a briefing on the Department's proposed Target Operating Model.	
The briefing covered the proposed target operating model that had been developed, the rationale and evidence for it and the expected resource requirements. It was noted that a consultation period with staff was due to start shortly.	
2. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel discussed the findings and recommendations of its review for inclusion in the final report.	
The Panel considered whether there were any conflicts of interest to declare in relation to its work or final report. It was noted that there were no conflicts of interest to declare.	
3. Revenue Administration Law	
Noting the limited time period for the Panel to review and act on the submissions it had received, it was agreed to ask the Minister for Treasury and Resources to delay the debate of the draft Revenue Administration Law for 2 further sittings, until 26th February 2019.	SS
4. Draft Public Finances Law	
Recalling the briefing it had received on 11th January on work on a new public finances law, the Panel agreed to co-opt Senator Sarah Ferguson for a review of the draft law. It was noted that a follow up briefing had been arranged for 8th February 2019.	SS

5. One Government Review

The Panel recalled that it had agreed to commence a review of the One Government project in February 2019. It was agreed to establish a sub-panel to undertake the review and that Senator Sarah Ferguson and Deputy Scott Wickenden would be invited to join the sub-panel.

Record of Electronic Meeting

Date: 24th January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Absent	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel noted receipt of the final draft of its report on the Draft Damages (Jersey) Law and approved the report for presentation to the States Assembly.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 31st January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	John Shenton, Director of Tax, Grant Thornton
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law	
The Panel received John Shenton, Director of Tax at Grant Thornton, for a Public Hearing on the draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
After the witness had withdrawn, the Panel considered the evidence it had heard. It was agreed to seek a commitment from the Minister for Treasury and Resources to publish guidance on terms used within the draft law and a clear timeline for bringing forward other areas of tax reform.	
The Panel also agreed to issue instructions for amendments to the draft law to be drawn up in relation to the following:	
 A statutory assessment window To limit the production powers contained in Article 26 of the draft law to cases of careless or deliberate error 	
 Interest rates on overpaid and late paid tax to be set by Regulations 	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Item 4 only:
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Item 1 only:
	Wendy Martin, Partner and Head of Tax, EY
	Item 4 only:
	Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law	
The Panel received Wendy Martin, Partner and Head of Tax at EY, for a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
After the witness had withdrawn, the Panel agreed to write to the Comptroller of Taxes to request further information on some of the points raised in the hearing.	ss
The Panel noted that law drafting instructions for amendments to the draft law had been circulated to it in advance of the meeting. The Panel agreed changes to the instructions and approved the revised version to be sent to the legislative drafters.	ss
2. One Gov Review Panel	
It was noted that the Chairmen's Committee had agreed to establish a Review Panel to review the One Gov public sector reform programme. It was noted that Constable Shenton-Stone had expressed an interest in joining the Review Panel.	
3. States Business	
The Panel received an update from the Scrutiny Officer on information previously requested on Ministerial Decisions in relation to applications under the Control of Housing and Work (Jersey) Law 2012. It was noted that a high level summary of the applications had been received. It was agreed to request further detail on the number and type of applications considered.	SS
4. Public Finances Law	
Senator Sarah Ferguson joined the meeting as a co-opted member of the Panel for the purposes of the review of the draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law.	
Recalling that it was due to receive a briefing on the draft law later that week, the Panel reviewed the latest version of the draft law and noted areas of questioning to raise during the briefing.	СТ

Record of Meeting

Date: 8th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (co-opted Panel member)
	Deputy Rowland Huelin (Public Accounts Committee member)
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Steven Warren, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit
	Maria Washington, Regulatory Adviser
	Rob Kirkby, KPMG
	Mark Ashburn, KPMG
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Finances Law	
The Panel received a briefing from the Treasurer of the States, consultants from KPMG and other officers, on work to develop a new Public Finances Law.	
It was noted that the new law would be based around a "Government Plan" to replace the existing Medium Term Financial Plan and Budget processes. The timeline for developing the new law was discussed, including the interaction with the timeline for lodging the Government Plan for 2020.	
It was further noted that the new law was less prescriptive than the current law, with a number of areas of detail now to be included within a Public Finances Manual.	
The briefing covered a number of key areas of the draft law, a working draft of which had been provided to the Panel in advance of the briefing.	
After the witnesses had withdrawn, the Panel agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to highlight the lack of an explanatory brief to go alongside the working draft of the law provided to the Panel. It was agreed to also emphasise that the Panel considered the move to a Government Plan to be a positive step, but to ask the Minister to consider proposing just that part of the draft law at this stage.	
2. Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel noted that a draft amendment and accompanying report in relation to the Revenue Administration Law had been circulated to it for consideration. The Panel approved the amendment and report for lodging with the Greffier.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Steven Warren, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing on States Finances	
The Panel received a briefing from the Treasurer of the States on the States' finances	
The briefing covered the status of the States' 2018 accounts, the income forecasts for 2019 and beyond, the forecast deficit and the role of the Investment Appraisal Board.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (for item 2 only)
Apologies	
In attendance	Item 1 only: John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Item 2 only: Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing The Panel received the Chief Operating Officer and Chief of Staff for an introductory meeting and an initial briefing on the Target Operating Model for the Chief Operating Office.	
The briefing covered key issues facing the Chief Operating Office, particularly in relation to IT strategy and systems.	
The proposed Target Operating Model for the Chief Operating Office was explained to the Panel, and the role the COO would play in delivering the £30m savings target identified by the Chief Minister.	
The briefing also covered the level of investment required in IT systems, the Team Jersey project and the implementation of States HR policies.	
2. Draft Public Finances Law	
The Panel reviewed and amended the draft terms of reference and a scoping document in respect of its review. It agreed it would wish to appoint an advisor on the proposed Law and requested the officer to circulate a draft engagement brief for that purpose.	
The Panel recalled its letter to the Minister for Treasury and Resources requesting her to consider delaying the lodging of the Law to allow sufficient time for scrutiny. It noted a response was expected by 18th February and agreed to meet to discuss further on 28th February at 3pm.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th February 2019

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Andy Harris, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel noted an updated version of its report on the Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201 The Panel discussed and agreed changes to the report based on the comments received from factual accuracy checking.	
The Panel agreed that, subject to the agreed changes being made, the report S.R.3/2019 Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201- would be presented on Friday 22nd February 2019.	АН

Record of Meeting

Date: 25th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The records of the meetings held on 8th, 11th, 16th (Public and Private), 21st and 22nd January 2019 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law	
It was noted that the Panel's report on the draft law had been presented to the States on 22nd February.	
3. One Gov Review	
The Panel noted that a separate Review Panel had been established to review the One Gov programme and that Constable Shenton-Stone had been appointed as Chairman.	
4. States Business	
The Panel reviewed recent ministerial decisions and noted that a migration policy development board had been formed. The Panel recalled that it had already planned to commence a review of population and migration when its own capacity allowed. It was agreed to raise the matter with the Chief Minister and continue the Panel's planned review, when capacity and resources allowed.	SS
The Panel also noted a ministerial decision regarding the re-appointment of the Chairman of the Public Employees Pension Fund and the Jersey Teachers Superannuation Fund. It was agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to ask questions and about the length of term of office, remuneration and appointments process.	SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman PAC (co-opted for Item 2)
Apologies	
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson , Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel discussed various aspects of its report on the Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201-, including issues relating to 'High Value Residents'.	
2. Draft Public Finance (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel noted an updated version of the draft Law (v.32) and a comparative document supplied by the Treasury. The Panel approved an engagement brief for the Chartered Institute of Public Finances and Accountancy to undertake a desktop analysis of the proposed Law for approximately 3-5 days.	
The Panel considered recent correspondence from the Minister for Treasury and Resources declining to separate the Government Plan from the proposed Law, or delay its lodging. The Panel agreed to send the Minister a further letter expressing its disappointment at having to scrutinise the Law in such a short timescale.	
The Panel also agreed to send the Law, once lodged, to various interested parties and invite comments.	
The Panel further agreed it would discuss the Public Finance Law review at 11am at future meetings so that Senator Ferguson could attend.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Senator Sarah Ferguson, (Co-opted member, Item 3 only)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel recalled that the draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law (P.122/2018) had been referred back to the Minister for Treasury and Resources during the States sitting on 26th February.	
It was noted that an urgent meeting with the Minister was being arranged to discuss the additional information that the Minister planned to provide to the Assembly in relation to the draft law.	
2. Quarterly Hearing with Treasury Minister 11th March 2019	
The Panel agreed to reduce the topic areas for the quarterly hearing to the following: its report on the Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 201-, Government Plan, Investment Appraisal Board and States' Employment Board.	SS
Issues including Public Finances Law, the Finance Transformation Project and Statesowned companies would be discussed at separate meetings and future public hearings.	
3. Draft Public Finance (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel agreed a list of potential stakeholders from whom it would wish to receive submissions once the draft Law was lodged. The Panel noted a letter had been sent to the Minister expressing disappointment at having to scrutinise the Law in such a short timescale.	
The Panel also explored the possibility of undertaking comparative work with other jurisdictions and requested the officer to liaise with the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association in this regard.	CT/SS
The Panel further agreed it would discuss the Public Finance Law Review at 11am at future CSSP meetings in order that Senator Ferguson could attend, and requested the officer to make the necessary arrangements to include it on the agenda as a standing item. It also agreed to request the Minister for Treasury and Resources attend a public hearing on the subject on 28th March 2019 at 2pm.	

4. Quorum

It was noted that, with the exception of Item 3, the Panel was not quorate and therefore any matters requiring a decision of the Panel were deferred until a future meeting.

Record of Meeting

Date: 6th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Stephen Hardwick, Director of Communications, Government of Jersey Christian May, Head of Communications, Government of Jersey Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing on Government Communications Team	
The Panel received the Director of Communications for a briefing on the communications team.	
The structure and remit of the communications team was discussed, including the work to remodel the team under the One Gov project.	
It was noted that marketing and digital design was now undertaken by an in-house design team, which saved money on external contracts.	
The Freedom of Information response process was discussed and the extent of the involvement of the communications team was explained.	
The Panel asked about how savings generated by the communications team would be captured. It was noted that this was difficult to do, as some savings would be in other departments and offset against other areas. However, some savings could be identified in relation to contracted design work.	
The Panel was updated on the work to appoint a permanent director of communications, as well as the number of staff and vacancies within the team.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes
	Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes
	Tom Queree, Legislation and Policy Manager, Treasury and Exchequer
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel met with the Minister for Treasury and Resources to discuss the draft Revenue Administration Law, following the decision of the States Assembly to refer the draft law back to the Minister for further information.	
The Panel raised the evidence provided to it during its review about the lack of progress with technical tax reforms. It was explained that these type of reforms had to compete alongside other work streams for the department, including where Ministers or the States Assembly requested particular pieces of work.	
The Treasury's engagement with the tax community was explained to the Panel, as well as the forward work programme.	
The further tranches of the Revenue Administration Law were outlined to the Panel, along with the likely timelines.	
The Panel was also updated on the ongoing work to reform the personal tax system.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Quarterly Public Hearing	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 21st March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (Co-opted member, Item 4 only)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of meetings held on 24th and 31st January and 5th February 2019.	
2. Question Plan	
The Panel discussed its question plan for the public hearing with the Chief Minister on 25th March.	
3. States Business	
The Panel reviewed recent Ministerial Decisions within its remit. It was agreed to seek further information in relation to applications considered under the Control of Housing and Work Law.	ss
4. Draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel discussed question areas for its public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 28th March.	
It was agreed to invite States Members to submit comments to the Panel on the draft Law.	СТ

Record of Meeting

Date: 25th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Chris Stephenson, Director, HR Employment Relations and Organisational Development Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel received the Chief Minister for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard (item 1 only)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (co-opted member)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Item 2 only:
	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsey Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Kevin Hemmings, Head of Decision Support, Treasury and Exchequer
	Maria Washington, Consultant, Treasury and Exchequer
	Rob Kirkby, Partner, KPMG

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Public Finances Law Review Hearing	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister and officers for a public hearing on the draft Public Finances Law. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
2. Draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel noted receipt of a final report from its advisor, the Chartered Institute of Public Finances and Accountancy. It was agreed to publish the advisor's report immediately, along with a submission received from the Comptroller and Auditor General. It was further agreed to prepare a news release to issue alongside the publication of the report.	СТ
It was agreed to start preparing a comments paper outlining the Panel's initial findings, to be presented to the Assembly prior to the debate of the draft law on 30th April 2019.	СТ
It was noted that the officer would start compiling a list of possible amendments to the draft Law that had been identified through the Panel's work.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th April 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (co-opted member)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Deputy Scott Wickenden
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel met with Deputy Scott Wickenden to receive his comments on the draft Law. The Panel discussed possible amendments to the draft Law and, noting that the deadline for amendments to be lodged was the following week, agreed that it would be necessary to call-in the draft Law for further scrutiny during the debate on 30th April.	
It was agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to advise her of the Panel's decision and to notify States Members at the same time.	SS
It was agreed to explore options to include Deputy Wickenden in the Panel's work on amendments to the draft Law. It was noted that an updated table to possible amendments would be circulated to the Panel after the meeting.	ss

Record of Meeting

Date: 16th April 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (co-opted member, item 3 only)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer (Item 3 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Revenue Administration Law	
It was noted that the Minister had published an addendum to P.122/2018 Draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law, providing further information on the draft Law. It was agreed to issue a comments paper outlining the Panel's concerns about the piecemeal development of the draft Law.	ss
It was also agreed to seek representations from the tax community regarding the information provided in the addendum.	SS
2. 2018 Underspends	
It was noted the Minister for Treasury and Resources had recently signed a Ministerial Decision to allocate underspends from 2018. It was agreed to submit a written question for the next States sitting, seeking further information about the underspends and also about remaining available contingency funds.	SS
3. Contingency Allocations	
The Panel noted that R.38/2019 Allocation to Contingency: Revised Policy March 2019 had been presented to the States by the Minister for Treasury and Resources. It was agreed to write to the Minister to request that copies of documents in relation to Contingency Allocations be provided routinely going forward.	ss
4. Board Appointments	
Noting the presentation to the States of R.23/2019 Jersey Appointments Commission: Annual Report 2018, the Panel agreed to submit an oral question for the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the number of board appointments within armslength companies held by a single individual at one time.	SS
5. Draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law 201-	
The Panel recalled that it had previously agreed to investigate options for including Deputy Scott Wickenden in its work on amendments to the draft Law. It was agreed to form a sub-Panel for this purpose, involving Senator Moore, Senator Ferguson and Deputy Wickenden. Other members of the Panel would be asked if they also wished to join.	

The Panel discussed possible amendments to the draft law and agreed to give consideration to holding a public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources to obtain further evidence with regard to any amendments.

It was agreed to write to the Office of the Information Commissioner, the Official Analyst and the Office of the Dean to request submissions in relation to their removal from the list of non-ministerial States bodies.

SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 23rd April 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister
	Duncan Gibaut, Chief Statistician, Statistics Jersey
	Dan Edmonds, Statistics Jersey
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing on Population Statistics	
The Panel received a briefing from the Chief Minister and the Chief Statistician on a report published by Statistics Jersey: Estimating Government Receipts and	
Expenditure for Jersey Households.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th May 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Absent	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Draft Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel noted that the draft Law was scheduled to be debated on 21st May 2019. The Panel recalled that it had agreed to present a comments paper prior to the debate, outlining its final comments on the draft Law. The Panel discussed the content of the comments paper and noted that a draft would be circulated for it to consider.	SS
2. Work programme	
The Panel discussed its work programme and, noting a two month window before the Government Plan was due to be lodged, agreed to undertake a short review of population and migration. The scope and methodology of the review were discussed and it was noted that a scoping document and terms of reference would be prepared for the Panel to consider.	
3. States Business The Panel discussed forthcoming items of States Business and recent ministerial decisions and agreed no further action was necessary.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th May 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Public Finances Law	
The Chairman updated the Panel on the work of the Public Finances Law Sub-Panel. The Panel then reviewed and noted the draft amendments being prepared by the Sub-Panel.	
2. Population and Migration Review	
The Panel discussed the scope of its review, and possible stakeholders. It was agreed that Deputy Perchard would lead the review and work with the Officers to prepare a scoping document and terms of reference.	SS/TS
3. Target Operating Models	
It was agreed to request copies of Target Operating Models and business cases for all government departments within the Panel's remit.	SS
4. Draft Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel noted that a comments paper in relation to the draft Law was being drafted and would be circulated electronically for it to review.	ss
5. Public Sector Pay	
Noting the ongoing public sector strikes and the ongoing pay dispute, the Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to ask what action he was taking to resolve matters. It was also agreed to request copies of recent States Employment Board meetings.	TS
6. Draft Pensions Regulations (P.37/2019 and P.38/2019)	
The Panel noted that P.37 and P.38 were due to be debated by the States Assembly on 21st May and that it would be helpful if the debate could be deferred in order for the Panel to have time to consider the Regulations in more detail. It was agreed to ask the States Employment Board to defer the debate until the sitting on 4th June 2019.	SS

Record of Electronic Meeting

Date: 17th May 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Deputy Steve Ahier Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Draft Revenue Administration Law The Panel noted that a comments paper in relation to the draft Law had been circulated for it to review. The Panel approved the comments paper for presentation to the States Assembly, subject to a minor amendment suggested by the Chairman.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th May 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Public Finance (Jersey) Law 201-	SS
The Chairman updated the Panel on the work of the Sub-Panel, and noted that amendments to the draft Law had been lodged by both the Panel and by the Minister for Treasury & Resources, following discussions between the Sub-Panel and the Minister. It was noted that a comments paper was being drafted to outline the work undertaken initially by the Panel, and then subsequently by the Sub-Panel. The comments paper was to be circulated to the Panel later that week.	
2. Population & Migration	SS
Deputy Perchard updated the Panel on the formation of the review and explained the draft terms of reference. The Panel agreed to start work on the review and agreed to request an initial meeting with the Migration Policy Development Board.	
The Panel discussed possible stakeholders and noted that a scoping document would be prepared. The Panel agreed to a preliminary timetable to publish a report by 17th July, with hearings to begin the week of the 24th June.	
3. Draft Pensions Regulations (P.37/2019 and P.38/2019)	SS
It was noted that P.37/2019 and P.38/2019 had been deferred from the previous week's States sitting at the Panel's request. It was noted that it would be helpful for the Panel to be better informed on the draft Regulations prior to the Assembly debating them.	
The Panel agreed to locate a copy of the most recent trustees report on the pension fund. The Panel agreed to request a private briefing on the Regulations before the upcoming States debate.	

4. States Employment Board	
The Panel noted receipt of a confidential submission from a member of the public regarding the ongoing public sector pay dispute.	
The Panel recalled that it had written to the Chief Minister, as Chairman of the States Employment Board, requesting an update on the dispute, and noted that a response had not yet been received. It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister again, and also to publicly express the Panel's dissatisfaction with the lack of a reply.	
5. States Business	SS
The Panel discussed forthcoming items of States Business and recent ministerial decisions and agreed no further action was necessary.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Connétable Richard Buchanan, Vice-Chairman, States Employment Board Graham Chidlow, Head of Shared Service Centre, Treasury and Exchequer Simon Stammers, Manager – Pension Fund Administration, Treasury and Exchequer Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Pensions Regulations (P.37/2019 and P.38/2019)	
The Panel received a briefing from the Vice Chairman of the States Employment Board in relation to draft Pensions Regulations, <u>P.37/2019</u> and <u>P.38/2019</u> .	
The briefing covered the number of employees who could be affected by the changes contained in the draft Regulations, the cost implications and the involvement of the pension scheme trustees with the changes.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 13th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chairman
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes
	Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Quarterly Public Hearing	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 25th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Items 7 and 8 only: Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Item 7 only: Deputy Scott Wickenden, Assistant Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff, Government of Jersey Chris Stephenson, Director of Employment Relations Item 8 only: Connétable Chris Taylor, Assistant Chief Minister Neil Stocks, Policy Principal, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department AII: Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 5th, 6th, 7th, 11th, 21st and 25th March 2019.	
2. Population & Migration Review	
The Panel received an update on the call for evidence for the Population & Migration Review and noted receipt of submissions received from members of the public.	
3. One Gov Review Panel	
Constable Shenton-Stone updated the Panel on the work of the One Gov Review Panel, including a number of public hearings that had been held.	
4. Government Plan	
The Panel received an update from the Chairman on the possible structure for scrutinising the Government Plan, and discussed the work the Panel was likely to undertake.	

5. Question Planning for Quarterly Hearing	
The Panel reviewed and made amendments to a question plan for its Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Minister.	
6. States Business	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and agreed that no further action was necessary.	
7. States of Jersey Development Company	
The Panel noted receipt of a communication from Save our Shoreline raising concerns about the Horizon development being undertaken by the States of Jersey Development Company.	
It was agreed to invite the States of Jersey Development Company to brief the Panel on the Horizon development, as well as its work programme in general.	SS
8. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister to a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
9. Population and Migration Review Hearing	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister to a Population and Migration Review Hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman (Item 1 only) Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Deputy Richard Renouf, Minister for Health and Social Services (Item 2 only) Becky Sherington, Head of Nursing and Governance (Item 2 only) Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Quorum	
It was noted that Deputy Ahier was not able to attend the public hearing with the Minister for Health and Social Services. It was agreed to continue with the hearing, notwithstanding that the Panel would not be quorate.	
Population and Migration Review Hearing with Minister for Health and Social Services	
The Panel welcomed the Minister for Health and Social Services to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 1st July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Deputy John Young, Minister for the Environment Steve Skelton, Director of Strategy and Innovation Neil Stocks, Policy Principal, Immigration and Migration Policy Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Population and Migration Review Hearing with Minister for the Environment	
The Panel welcomed the Minister for the Environment and officers to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Connétable Chris Taylor, Chairman, Migration Policy Development Board Sue Duhamel, Director Strategic Policy Performance and Population Department Neil Stocks, Policy Principal, Customs and Immigration Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
Population and Migration Review Hearing with Migration Policy Development Board	
The Panel welcomed the Chairman of the Migration Policy Development Board and officers to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Item 1 only: Graeme Smith, Chief Executive, Jersey Business Lorie Rault, Chief Executive, Jersey Retail Association Item 2 only: Peter Le Maistre, President Jersey Farmers Union Douglas Richardson, Vice-President, Jersey Farmers Union Joe Moynihan, Chief Executive, Jersey Finance Amy Bryant, Deputy Chief Executive, Jersey Finance Item 3 only: Murray Norton, Chief Executive, Jersey Chamber of Commerce Jennifer Carnegie, President, Jersey Chamber of Commerce All: Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
Population and Migration Review Hearing with Jersey Business	
The Panel welcomed representatives of Jersey Business and Jersey Retail Association to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
Population and Migration Review Hearing with Jersey Farmer's Union and Jersey Finance	
The Panel welcomed representatives of Jersey Farmer's Union and Jersey Finance to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
3. Population and Migration Review Hearing with Jersey Chamber of Commerce	
The Panel welcomed representatives of Jersey Chamber of Commerce to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th July 2019

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard (Except for Item 5)
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
In Attendance	Senator Tracey Vallois, Minister for Education (Item 5 only) Paul Horsfall, Officer Responsible for Demographic Planning & Sites (Item 5 only) Sboohi Famili, Director of Young People, Further Education Development, Skills & Learning (Children, Young People, Education & Skills) (Item 5 only) Simon Soar, Chief Executive Officer, Jersey Hospitality Association (Item 6 only) Stephen Clipp, Committee Member (Item 6 only) Andrew Baird, Committee Member (Item 6 only) Gary Eisner, Scrutiny Officer (Items 1 to 5 only) Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer (Items 1 to 5 only) Kellie Boydens, Scrutiny Officer (Item 6 only)

Agenda matter	
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 28th March and 9th,16th and 23rd April 2019.	
2. Population and Migration Review	
The Panel discussed the draft heads of report and noted that drafting would start shortly. The Panel also discussed the question plan for its public hearing with the Children's Commissioner on 11th July.	
3. Government Plan	
The Panel received an update from the Officer on the expected lodging date for the Government Plan and likely structure and timings for its review.	
4. Quorum	
It was noted that Deputy Perchard was not able to attend the public hearing with the Minister for Education which was scheduled to take place immediately after the meeting. It was agreed to continue with the hearing, notwithstanding that the Panel would not be quorate, subject to the witness being in agreement.	

5. Population and Migration Hearing

The Panel welcomed the Minister for Education and officers to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.

6. Population and Migration Review: Meeting with the Jersey Hospitality Association

The Panel met with the Chief Executive Officer and members of the Jersey Hospitality Association (JHA) to discuss their views on migration and population. This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 33.

Record of Meeting

Date: 30th July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Gary Eisner, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 7th, 14th, 17th and 28th May 2019.	
2. Population and Migration Review	
The Panel received an update from the Officers on the progress of the draft report, and discussed findings and recommendations for inclusion in the report. The Panel also noted that a list of academic articles for inclusion in the report had been prepared and the list could be recommended to the Migration Policy Board to consider.	
The Panel agreed to write to the Minister for Social Security to enquire as to whether people arriving in Jersey were now required to list any children they would be bringing into the Island with them.	TS
3. Government Plan 2020	
The Panel noted that the Government Plan had been lodged on 23rd July 2019 and discussed the possible scope of its work. It was noted that whilst the Government Plan proposed £40 million of efficiency savings, it did not contain a breakdown of the efficiencies. It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to ask for an explanation.	SS
4. Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel noted receipt of a letter to the Chairman from the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the second tranche of the Revenue Administration Law.	
5. Contract Law	
The Panel noted recently reported concerns about uncertainty in contract law in Jersey, and agreed to write to the Law Society of Jersey and to the Chief Minister to gain further insight.	TS

6. Consultation on the Tax Treatment of Mutual Trading

The Panel noted the receipt of a summary of responses to the consultation exercise on the tax treatment of mutual trading and recommendations from Revenue Jersey.

7. States Business

The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and agreed that no further action was necessary.

8. Items for Communication

It was agreed to use social media to promote the Panel's work on the Government Plan, starting with a focus on the proposed efficiency savings.

9. Future Meetings

The Panel agreed to move its meeting on 20th August 2019 to 9.30am on Wednesday 28th August 2019 in the Blampied Room.

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th August 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 7th, 11th, 13th, 25th and 28th June, and 1st and 3rd July 2019.	
2. Population and Migration Review	
The Panel received an update from Deputy Perchard on the progress of the draft report, and agreed to provide any final comments on the draft report by 30th August. It was noted that once the main body of the report was agreed, the final process of stakeholder checking, agreeing findings and recommendations and final formatting would take 3 to 4 weeks.	
3. Government Plan 2020	
The Panel approved the Terms of Reference and Scoping Document for its review of the Government Plan, and discussed the projects and other areas it had been assigned to review by the Government Plan Review Panel.	
It was noted that the Chairman had written to the Chief Minister on behalf of the Panel to request further information on the government efficiencies programme and that a response was due on 29th August.	
In approving the Scoping Document for the review, the Panel agreed the planned budget for its review, including the appointment of an expert advisor and the commissioning of focus groups to gauge public opinion on the Government Plan. It was noted that a draft engagement brief for appointing an expert advisor had been circulated to the Panel prior to the meeting.	
The Panel started detailed scrutiny of the investment projects included in the Government Plan which fell within its remit. For each project, the Panel identified areas where further information from Ministers was required and noted that information would be sought either in public hearings or through a written request.	

4. Contract Law

The Panel noted receipt of a reply from the President of the Law Society of Jersey in relation to the status of contract law in Jersey. It was agreed that no further action was necessary.

5. States Business

The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and, noting in particular the matters set out in R.109/2019 Finance Law Delegation Report for the 6 Month period to 30th June 2019, agreed to prepare questions on the rationale behind certain decisions for upcoming Quarterly Hearings with the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury & Resources.

6. Future Meetings

The Panel agreed to schedule an additional meeting on Thursday 29th August 2019 at 12:00pm in the Blampied Room to discuss its work on the Government Plan.

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd September 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Population and Migration Review	
The Panel discussed its draft report and agreed a number of changes. It was noted that Deputy Perchard was due to provide comments on the final section of the report. Subject to this, the report could be finalised and circulated to stakeholders for factual checking.	
2. Government Plan 2020	
The Panel noted receipt of letters from the Chief Minister dated 23rd August and 29th August in relation to the provision of information on the Government Plan to scrutiny panels and the efficiencies programme.	
Continuing its scrutiny of the investment projects within the Government Plan, the Panel reviewed the remaining projects within its remit, together will all relevant capital projects. A number of areas were identified where further information was required to be sought from ministers.	SS
Noting the significant amount of Information Technology expenditure in the Government Plan, the Panel agreed to arrange a public hearing with the relevant minister and officers to discuss IT strategy. The Officer advised the Panel that a briefing paper on IT expenditure within the Government Plan was being prepared.	тѕ
The Panel noted receipt of a quote from the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) for providing advisory services. It was agreed to request that the scope of the engagement be narrowed slightly and that a revised quote be provided.	SS
3. Briefings	
The Panel noted the arrangements for a number of forthcoming private briefings.	
4. States Business	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and agreed that no further action was necessary.	

5. Future Meetings

It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was due to take place on Tuesday 17th September 2019 at 9.30am.

Record of Electronic Meeting

Date: 10th September 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Absent	Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Government Plan 2020	
The Panel noted receipt of quotes from the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) and 4insight as follows:	
 £10,450 (plus expenses) from CIPFA to provide advisory services to the Panel regarding the Government Plan. 	
2. £8,040 from 4insight to provide focus groups.	
It was agreed to accept the quotes and proceed with the appointment of CIPFA and 4insight.	

Record of Electronic Meeting

Date: 17th September 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chair Deputy Jess Perchard (Not Item 6) Connétable Richard Vibert (Not item 6) Deputy Kirsten Morel, Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel (Item 6 only)
Absent	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Items 1 to 6: Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer Item 4 only: Dorothy Parker, 4insight Item 5 only: Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources Rishard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance Stephanie Ward, Finance Manager Item 6 only: Deputy Scott Wickenden, Assistant Chief Minister with responsibility for digital technology John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 5th, 9 th (public and private) and 30th July, and 28th August 2019.	
2. Population & Migration	
The Panel approved its draft report on Population and Migration and agreed that the main body of the report could be circulated to stakeholders for factual checking. It was noted that findings and recommendations would be worked on over the next couple of weeks.	
3. Government Plan	
It was noted that a number of documents relevant to the Panel's review of the Government Plan had been circulated prior to the meeting, including confidential supporting information for business cases, a submission from a member of the public, the call for evidence, and a timetable for the review.	
It was further noted that a revised scoping document had been circulated and approved electronically by the panel prior to the meeting. The revised scoping document included	

an increased budget to cover the quotes provided by the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy and from 4insight for running focus groups.

4. Meeting with 4insight regarding Focus Groups

The Panel received representatives of 4ingisht to discuss the establishment and coordination of focus groups for the Government Plan review.

5. Briefing on Revenue Jersey

The Panel received the Minister for Treasury & Resources, Assistant Minister and officers for a briefing on the Revenue Jersey Target Operating Model and Government Plan investment proposals. The briefing also covered recent delays in processing tax returns following the implementation of Revenue Jersey's new tax system.

6. Public Hearing on Government Plan IT expenditure

The Panel received Deputy Scott Wickenden, Assistant Chief Minister with responsibility for digital technology and the Chief Operating Officer for a public hearing on IT expenditure in the Government Plan. The Hearing was webcast and a transcript was taken.

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th September 2019

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Connétable Chris Taylor, Assistant Chief Minister Deputy Hugh Raymond, Assistant Minister for Health and Social Services Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department Mark Grimley, Group Director, People and Corporate Services Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister, Assistant Ministers and officers to a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was webcast and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 27th September 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chair Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Deput Scott Wickenden, Assistant Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States Jonathan Williams, Director of Business Change Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Hearing with the Chief Minister regarding the Government Plan	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister, Assistant Minister and officers to a public hearing on the Government Plan. The hearing was webcast and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 1st October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 3rd and 10th September.	
2. Population & Migration Review	
Noting the absence of the lead member on the Report, the Panel deferred consideration of this item until its next meeting.	
3. Public Hearings	
The Panel discussed a draft question plan for the quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury & Resources on 3rd October.	
4. Government Plan Review	
The Panel noted receipt of confidential Government Plan supporting information on the efficiencies programme and departmental budgeting and discussed the progress of the review.	
Noting the significant amount of spending on IT in the Government Plan, the Panel requested officers to research the amount of funding for IT projects approved by the previous Council of Ministers in the lead up to the election in 2018. The Panel also discussed a number of areas of the proposed IT spending in the Government Plan that it would explore further during its review.	
It was agreed that a future review of IT spending, including the input of an expert advisor, would be necessary.	
5. HR Lounge	
The Panel discussed the findings of the 2018 HR Lounge Report into bullying and harassment and agreed to examine whether recommendations from the report had been enacted.	
6. Ministerial Decisions	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury & Resources to enquire about the remaining balance from the contingency funding allocated to the Jersey Care Inquiry in 2015.	
7. Future Meetings	
The Panel agreed to meet weekly during the course of the Government Plan Review, with the next meeting scheduled for 09:30 on Thursday 10th October.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources (Item 2)
	Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources (Item
	2)
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States (Item 2)
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes (Item 2)
	Stuart Fair, Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (Item 1
	and 2)
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer (Item 1 and 2)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Government Plan Review	
The Panel met with its advisor from the Chartered Institute of Finance and Accountancy to discuss the progress of his work in connection with the Government Plan. It was noted that the advisor was due to meet with a number of senior officers later that day to gather evidence for his report.	
The Panel discussed possible areas of the Government Plan where it could bring amendments. It was agreed to begin scoping these out.	SS
2. Quarterly Public Hearing	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 10th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Government Plan Review	
The Panel received an update from the officers on the progress in drafting its report on the Government Plan. Noting that its report would include a "Red, Amber, Green" (RAG) rating for each project within its remit, the Panel discussed and agreed its ratings.	
The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to request further information on the Government Plan business case for Supply Jersey.	SS
The Panel also discussed possible amendments to the Government Plan.	
2. Future Meetings It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was due to take place on Tuesday 15th October at 09:30am in the Blampied Room.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Dorothy Parker, 4insight
	Beatrice Speck, 4insight
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Government Plan Review – meeting with 4insight	
The Panel welcomed representatives from 4insight to present the findings of the focus group sessions conducted in relation to the Government Plan Review.	
It was noted that four focus group sessions were held with members of the public and that Panel members and officers had observed some of the sessions.	
The structure of the sessions and key themes arising out of them were discussed.	
2. Government Plan Review - amendments	
The Panel discussed possible amendments to the Government Plan, including:	
 Stamp Duty increases A loan deposit scheme Fuel Duty/Congestion Charge IT expenditure Food Costs Bonus 	
It was noted that further work would be undertaken to scope the possible amendments and a briefing paper would be provided to the Panel to discuss the options further.	TS

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chair
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Sam Cooper, Branch President, National Association of Head Teachers
	Brendan Carolan, Joint Secretary, National Education Union, Jersey Section
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
Public Hearing with the National Association of Head Teachers and the National Education Union	
The Panel welcomed representatives from the National Association of Head Teachers and the National Education Union for a public hearing on the Government Plan and the proposed Efficiencies Programme. The hearing was webcast and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Terry Renouf, Local Branch Chair, Jersey Civil Service Association
	Gary Davies, Vice-President, Jersey Civil Service Association
	Lyndsay Feltham, Branch Chair, Civil Service Unite
	Tommy Querns, Convenor, Unite
	Marina Mauger, Representative, National Association of Schoolmasters
	Union of Women Teachers Representative

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Hearing with Trade Unions	
The Panel welcomed representatives of Trade Unions for a public hearing on the Government Plan and the proposed Efficiencies Programme. The hearing was webcast and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Government Plan Review - amendments	
The Panel noted receipt of a briefing paper outlining its possible amendments to the Government Plan.	
Each of the options was discussed and it was agreed to proceed with further research on amendments in relation to stamp duty, a loan deposit scheme and IT expenditure.	TS
With regards to a possible amendment to the fuel duty proposals in the Government Plan, it was noted that the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel was considering taking this forward and the Panel therefore agreed not to pursue its own amendment in this area.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 17th, 20th and 27th September 2019.	
2. Government Plan	
The Panel agreed a number of changes to its report and noted that factual accuracy comments from stakeholders were due to be received by the close of business on 5th November. The Panel also finalised and agreed the findings and recommendations for its report.	
The Panel discussed its proposed amendments to the Government Plan and agreed to consider three further amendments as follows:	
Reducing the proposed increase in the Long Term Care Charge	
2. Increasing the Food Costs Bonus	
3. Increasing Child Tax Allowances.	
3. Population & Migration	
It was noted that final changes had been made to the Panel's report on Population and Migration and that the report was due to be presented to the States Assembly the following week.	
4. Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel noted receipt of a letter from the Minister for Treasury & Resources giving notice that an Appointed Day Act to bring the Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law 2019 into force would be lodged shortly.	
The Panel recalled that it had written to the Minister on 23rd October to request that the next tranche of the Revenue Administration Law be lodged for debate separately and not alongside the Government Plan as proposed by the Minister. The Panel noted receipt of a further letter from the Minister agreeing to this request.	
The Panel agreed to write to the Minister to confirm agreement to the proposal. 5. States Business	
The Panel noted revised dates for two quarterly hearings as follows:	

Record of Meeting

Date: 8th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Cora O'Brien, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes
	Alison Rogers, Director, Investment Appraisal and Business Management
	Andrew Hacquoil, Head of Finance Transformation
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
Briefing on Income Forecasts and Personal Tax	
The Panel received a briefing from the Minister for Treasury and Resources and officers on the revised income forecasts for the Government Plan. It was noted that the revised forecasts were due to be published on Monday 11th November.	
The Minister outlined some changes to the Government Plan that would be made as a result of the revised income forecasts.	
It was noted that briefing papers on proposed changes to personal tax had been circulated prior to the meeting. The Panel thanked the Minister for the detailed information provided.	

4. Tuesday 19th November (2.30pm) – Minister for Treasury and Resources	
5. Friday 22nd November (10am) – Chief Minister	
6. Briefings	
It was noted that briefings on the following topics were being arranged for the Panel:	
6. Personal Tax changes	
7. Revenue Administration Law/Tax Compliance	
8. Office Strategy	
7. States Business	
The Panel reviewed relevant Ministerial Decisions and agreed that no further action was necessary.	
8. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was due to take place on Tuesday 19th November at 9:30am in the Blampied Room	

Record of Electronic Meeting

Date: 11th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Absent	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Government Plan - amendments	
The Panel noted receipt of the final drafts of its amendments to the Government Plan as follows:	
 Long Term Care Charge Child Tax Allowances Food Costs Bonus Loan Deposit Scheme Stamp Duty 	

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Senator Sarah Ferguson (Chair, Public Accounts Committee)
	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Public Accounts Committee)
	Deputy Rowland Huelin (Public Accounts Committee)
Apologies	
In attendance	Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey
	John Rogers, Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment
	Department
	Steven Mair, Group Director, Performance Accounting and Reporting
	Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing on Office Strategy	
The Panel received a briefing from the Chief Executive and officers on the Government of Jersey's office strategy.	
The record of the meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Articles 33 and 35.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 19th November 2019

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 1st, 3rd and 10th October.	
2. Government Plan	
The Panel discussed the amendments that had been lodged to P.71/2019 Government Plan 2020-23 and the arrangements for the debate the following week. It was noted that the Vice Chair had discussed the Panel's amendment regarding increasing the Food Cost Bonus with the Minister for Social Security. 3. Quarterly Hearing	
The Panel recalled that it was due to hold a quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources later that day. It was noted that due to illness and unavailability of Panel Members, the Panel would not be quorate for the hearing. It was therefore agreed to notify the Minister that the hearing would be cancelled. A provisional rescheduled date of Monday 2nd December was agreed.	
The Panel noted receipt of a letter from the Chief Minister proposing alternative arrangements for the planned quarterly hearing on Friday 22nd November. It was agreed to move the hearing to Tuesday 3rd December.	
4. Work Programme	
The Panel considered its programme of work for the following months. It was noted that changes to the personal tax system were due to be lodged shortly and it was agreed that the Panel would review the proposals.	
It was also noted that the Panel had been briefed on the Government's Office Strategy and was due to receive the Strategic Outline Business Case (SOBC) for the project. It was agreed to defer consideration of any possible review work until it had reviewed the SOBC.	
The Panel noted that the Migration Policy Development Board was due to publish its final report by the end of March 2020. The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to ask for assurance that adequate time would be provided for the Panel to review the final policy report upon its publication.	

5. States Business	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and agreed that no follow-up was needed.	
6. Items for Communication	
It was noted that communication of the Panel's work would focus on Government Plan preparations.	
7. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's is next scheduled meeting was Tuesday 3rd December at 09.30am in the Blampied Room.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd December 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Gary Eisner, Scrutiny Officer Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer Item 3 only: Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Connétable Chris Taylor, Assistant Chief Minister Connétable Richard Buchanan, Assistant Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States Neil Stocks, Senior Policy Officer Mark Grimley, Group Director People and Corporate Services Jonathan Donovan, Strategic Director Employment Relations

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 15th, 17th, 18th and 24th October and 5th November 2019.	
2. Personal Tax Reform	
It was noted that P.119/2019 <i>Personal Tax Reforms</i> had been lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources for debate on 21st January 2020. The Panel agreed to conduct a review of the proposals. Noting the limited time frame to take evidence prior	SS
to the Christmas period, it was agreed to ask the Minister to defer the debate by one sitting. The Panel agreed to invite members of the tax community to provide evidence on how the proposed reforms.	GE
3. Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister, Assistant Chief Ministers and officers to a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was webcast and transcribed.	
4. States Business	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and noted that copies of exempt reports for a number of the decisions had been requested. It was agreed that the Officer would follow up on the request and circulate the reports to the Panel after the meeting.	SS
5. Meeting Dates for 2020	
The Panel received a list of proposed meeting dates for 2020 and agreed to seek alternate dates for several proposed meetings.	TS

6. Future Meetings

Recalling that it had a quarterly public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 5th December, the Panel noted that it would not be quorate for the hearing and agreed to ask the Minister to attend on an alternative date.

It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was due to take place on Tuesday 17th December at 9:30am in the Blampied Room

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th December 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chair
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice Chair
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Gary Eisner, Scrutiny Officer
	Theodore Stone, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Panel approved the records of the meetings held on 8th, 11th, 14th and 19th November and 3rd December 2019.	
2. Personal Tax Reform	
The Panel received a scoping document and terms of reference for the Personal Tax Reform review and requested that its impact on children and families be considered in both documents and to examine its further social implications.	GE
The Panel approved the decision to publish a comments paper by February.	
3. Government Plan Debrief	
The Panel discussed the processes of their review of the Government Plan and ways to improve it. This included a possible review of Stamp Duty within the Panel's Work Programme, to begin at least two months before the 2021 Government Plan was lodged.	
4. Office Strategy	
The Panel received hard copies of the Office Strategy Outline Business Case, supplied by the Office of the Chief Executive, and agreed to write to the Chief Minister and arrange hearings with him to question him on issues such as the cost of the Strategy, its oversight, and its rationale.	GE
5. States Business	
The Panel reviewed all recent Ministerial Decisions and two Housing & Work Advisory Group Reports supplied to the Panel and agreed that no follow-up was needed.	
6. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was due to take place on Tuesday 14th January at 9:30am in the Blampied Room	